UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE

Plaintiffs,

Defendants.

THE HONORABLE JAMAL N. WHITEHEAD

2

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

v.

KURT BENSHOOF, et al.,

MOSHE ADMON, et al.,

9

10 11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18 19

20

2122

23

BLAIR M. RUSS'S JOINDER OF THE CITY OF SEATTLE'S MOTION FOR A VEXATIOUS LITIGANT ORDER AGAINST KURT BENSHOOF - 1 NO. 2:23-cv-01392-JNW

BLAIR M. RUSS'S JOINDER OF THE CITY OF SEATTLE'S MOTION FOR A VEXATIOUS LITIGANT ORDER AGAINST KURT BENSHOOF

COMES NOW, Defendant Blair Russ ("Defendant Russ" or the "Undersigned") and files this Joinder of Defendant City of Seattle's Motion for Vexatious Litigant Order Against Plaintiff Kurt A. Benshoof (the "Motion"), Dkt. 250, and states in support thereof as follows:

Defendant Russ represented Jessica Owen ("Ms. Owen") in King County Superior

Court, Cause Nos. 22-2-02932-3 SEA, 22-2-03826-8 SEA (consolidated with 22-2-15745-3 SEA) and 22-2-15958-8 SEA, and the three appeals ensuing from two of those King County Superior Court matters: *Benshoof v. Owen*, No. 85465-8-I (Wash. Ct. App. Div. 1) (2023); *Benshoof v. Cliber, et al.*, No. 85092-0-I (Wash. Ct. App.) (Div. 1) (2023); and *Benshoof v. Cliber, et al.*, No. 86466-0-I (Wash. Ct. App.) (Div. 1) (2023).

In addition to being named as a defendant in 2:22-cv-01281-LK and this above captioned matter, Benshoof has named the Undersigned in two other matters in this Court filed under 2:22-cv-01281-LK (dismissed on July 19, 2024) and 2:24-cv-00808-TLF (filed June 7, 2024). In Benshoof's most recent filing (2:24-cv-00808-TLF), Benshoof has also named this

TOMLINSON BOMSZTYK RUSS

1000 Second Avenue, Suite 3660, Seattle, Washington 98104-1046 P/ 206.621.1871 F/ 206.621.9907

Case 2:23-cv-01392-JNW Document 256 Filed 07/25/24 Page 2 of 10

Court, King County Superior Court Judge Marshall Ferguson, Mr. Cliber's attorneys (Michael Tracey and Sarah Turner), and counsel for the Seattle School District – Jessica Skelton – as defendants.

Defendant Russ joins in the City of Seattle's Motion and incorporates the same as if fully stated herein with one minor correction to the statement of facts. In *Benshoof v. Owen*, No. 85465-8-I (Wash. Ct. App. Div. 1) (2023), Benshoof was represented by counsel and did not abandon that appeal. Oral argument was held in that matter on June 12, 2024, and the Panel has yet to render its decision.

For the reasons stated in the City of Seattle's Motion, Defendant Russ respectfully requests that this Court enter the City of Seattle's [Proposed] Vexatious Litigant Order Against Kurt A. Benshoof, Dkt. 250-1. Further, if the Court grants the Motion, Defendant Russ respectfully requests that the Order Restricting Abusive Litigation of Kurt Benshoof, entered by Judge Ferguson in King County Superior Court Case No. 22-2-15958-8 SEA on March 31, 2023, be attached to this Court's Order granting the Motion as an exhibit and, consistent with Judge Ferguson's March 1, 2024 Order finding Benshoof in contempt attached hereto as *Exhibit A*, that Benshoof be ordered to seek leave to proceed with the matter filed under 24-cv-00808-TLF or otherwise dismiss that matter within ten (10) days of entry of order on the City's motion herein.

I certify this this Joinder contains 398 words, in compliance with Local Civil Rules.

DATED: July 25, 2024

TOMLINSON BOMSZTYK RUSS

Blair M. Russ, WSBA #40374

Email: bmr@tbr-law.com

BLAIR M. RUSS'S JOINDER OF THE CITY OF SEATTLE'S MOTION FOR A VEXATIOUS LITIGANT ORDER AGAINST KURT BENSHOOF - 1



1000 Second Avenue, Suite 3660, Seattle, Washington 98104-1046 P/ 206.621.1871 F/ 206.621.9907 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on July 25, 2024, I caused the foregoing to be electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to all parties of record.

Lisa Sebree, Paralegal

Email: lae@tbr-law.com

BLAIR M. RUSS'S JOINDER OF THE CITY OF SEATTLE'S MOTION FOR A VEXATIOUS LITIGANT ORDER AGAINST KURT BENSHOOF - 1



Exhibit A

1 The Honorable Marshall Ferguson 2 3 4 5 6 7 IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF WASHINGTON IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF KING 8 9 KURT BENSHOOF, Case No. 22-2-15958-8 SEA 10 Plaintiff, ORDER FINDING OF CONTEMPT AND IMPOSING SANCTIONS 11 AGAINST PLAINTIFF KURT BENSHOOF 12 NATHAN CLIBER, JESSICA OWEN and MAGALIE LERMAN, 13 Defendants. 14 15 This matter comes before the Court on Defendant Nathan Cliber's Motion for Finding of 16 Contempt and Sanctions Against Plaintiff Kurt Benshoof ("Cliber's Motion"), Defendant Jessica 17 Owen's Motion for Finding and Contempt and Sanctions Against Plaintiff Kurt Benshoof 18 ("Owen's Motion"). The Court considered the arguments of the parties, the documents and 19 pleadings on file herein, including the following: 20 Cliber's Motion; 21 The Declaration of Sarah N. Turner in Support of Cliber's Motion; 22 Plaintiff's Opposition to Cliber's Motion; 23 Defendant Nathan Cliber's Reply in Support of Cliber's Motion; 24 Owen's Motion; 25 The Declaration of Jessica Owen in Support of Owen's Motion; 26 The Declaration of Paige Gagliardi in Support of Owen's Motion; GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI, LLP ORDER FINDING OF CONTEMPT AND IMPOSING Attorneys at Law 701 5th Avenue, Suite 2100 Seattle, Washington 98104 (206) 695-5100 SANCTIONS AGAINST PLAINTIFF KURT BENSHOOF - 1

- The Declaration of Moshe Y. Admon in Support of Cliber's and Owen's Motions;
- Plaintiff's Opposition to Owen's Motion; and
- Defendant Jessica Owen's Reply in Support of Owen's Motion.

Based upon such review and consideration, the Court GRANTS both Cliber's Motion and Owen's Motion, and enters the following FINDINGS OF FACT and CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

- 1. Plaintiff has disregarded and failed to comply with this Court's Order Restricting Abusive Litigation of Kurt Benshoof (the "Abusive Litigation Order") (Dkt. 189) in his filing and attempted service of new claims and causes of action in Western District of Washington Case No. 2:23-cv-01392-JNW and Western District of Washington Case No. 2:23-cv-01829-JHC (now JNW) upon Defendants Nathan Cliber, Jessica Owen, and the other "Persons Covered by This Order" (as those persons are defined in the Abusive Litigation Order);
- 2. Specifically, Plaintiff failed to file a contemporaneous motion for leave to proceed with his claims against Mr. Cliber, Jessica Owen and other Persons Covered by This Order (as those persons are defined in the Abusive Litigation Order) in both Case No. 2:23-cv-01392-JNW and Case No. 2:23-cv-01829-JHC, as required by the Abusive Litigation Order (at p. 6, ¶ 4);
- 3. Plaintiff also failed to file a copy of the Abusive Litigation Order with the federal court in Case No. 2:23-cv-01829-JHC, as required by the Abusive Litigation Order (at p. 6, ¶ 5);
- 4. In Case No. 2:23-cv-01392-JNW, Plaintiff did file a copy of the Abusive Litigation Order, but he did so by burying the order among 2,034 pages of exhibits to his complaint. Plaintiff filed a 184-page original complaint and later a 280-page amended complaint in Case No. 2:23-cv-01392-JNW. Plaintiff's 2,034-page exhibit filing occurred on September 26, 2023, seven calendar days after Plaintiff filed the original complaint. Within the 2,034 pages of exhibits, the Abusive Litigation Order can be found at Pages 563 through 571. Plaintiff buried the Abusive Litigation Order among numerous other exhibits to reduce the likelihood that the federal court would become aware of the order;

12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23 24

///

25

26

- 5. Plaintiff is in contempt of court for violating the Abusive Litigation Order.
- 6. The Abusive Litigation Order warned Mr. Benshoof that if he "fails to abide by the terms this Order, any party may move, or the Court sua sponte may move, for a finding of contempt and sanctions. A contempt finding could result in the imposition of jail time as a sanction." Abusive Litigation Order (p. 6, \P 6);
 - The Abusive Litigation Order included the Knight¹ warnings as an attachment; 7.
- 8. The Abusive Litigation Order clearly and unequivocally states that the filing restrictions in the order "apply to any and all future litigation Mr. Benshoof may attempt to bring" against the protected persons. Abusive Litigation Order, p. 5. The order further states that Mr. Benshoof is "ENJOINED AND RESTRAINED... from initiating any litigation whatsoever in any Superior Court in the state of Washington... unless Mr. Benshoof first obtains advanced approval from this Court" and that "If Mr. Benshoof seeks to commence a new action...in a court other than a Superior Court, Mr. Benshoof must first bring a motion in the other court for leave to proceed with the action." Id., p. 5, ¶ 1 and p. 6, ¶ 4. Although the Abusive Litigation Order is clear and unambiguous, the Court now clarifies, as guidance for Mr. Benshoof, that terms like "any and all future litigation" and "new action" in the Abusive Litigation Order include all claims, counterclaims, crossclaims, third party actions, and any other claims whatsoever brought by Mr. Benshoof in any court against the "Persons Covered by This Order" as defined in the Abusive Litigation Order.
- 9. Although the present Order does not include jail time as a sanction, any future violation(s) of the Abusive Litigation Order by Mr. Benshoof could potentially result in jail time as a remedial or punitive sanction.

¹ State ex rel. Schmitz v. Knight, 142 Wn. App. 291, 174 P.3d 1198 (2007). ORDER FINDING OF CONTEMPT AND SANCTIONS AGAINST PLAINTIFF KURT BENSHOOF - 3

Based upon the above findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Court ORDERS the following sanctions:

- A. Mr. Benshoof is ordered to pay the attorneys' fees and costs incurred by Defendants in bringing their respective motions for finding of contempt and sanctions against Mr. Benshoof, including supporting filings, declarations, and replies. Defendants shall submit their respective fee petitions to the Court within **14 days** of this Order.
- B. Mr. Benshoof shall pay the attorneys' fees and costs incurred by Mr. Cliber in bringing the Abusive Litigation Order to the attention of the federal court in Western District of Washington Case No. 2:23-cv-01392-JNW and Western District of Washington Case No. 2:23-cv-01829-JHC (now JNW). Mr. Cliber shall submit his fee petition to the Court within **14 days** of this Order.
- C. The Abusive Litigation Order's expiration date is extended by one year, to March 31, 2029.
- D. Mr. Benshoof shall file the leave motion ("Leave Motion") required by the Abusive Litigation Order in both Western District of Washington Case No. 2:23-cv-01392-JNW and Western District of Washington Case No. 2:23-cv-01829-JHC (now JNW) as to any and all Persons Covered by This Order, excluding Mr. Cliber, and including Moshe Admon, Owen Hermsen, Magalie Lerman, Jessica Owen, and Blair Russ (collectively, "Other Named Defendants Covered by this Order"). Such motion ("Leave Motion") shall be captioned "Motion for Leave to Proceed Against Certain Parties in Accordance with the Order Restricting the Abusive Litigation of Kurt Benshoof" and shall conspicuously identify the Abusive Litigation Order in the statement of facts. Plaintiff shall attach a copy of the Abusive Litigation Order as an exhibit to a separately filed supporting declaration, appendix, or addendum to the Leave Motion.
- E. Upon filing the Leave Motions, Mr. Benshoof shall file proof in this action of such filings in the federal court cases. Absent obtaining leave to proceed against the Other Named

Defendants Covered by this Order, Mr. Benshoof shall refrain from taking any action in pursuit of his claims against those individuals including but not limited to, attempting effectuate service and seeking affirmative relief in any form. To the extent necessary to comply with an impending deadline, Mr. Benshoof may seek to extend that deadline to an extent necessary to accommodate a ruling on the Leave Motion.

- F. Beginning one calendar week from the entry of this Order, for each day Mr. Benshoof has failed to the file the Abusive Litigation Order's required leave motion in BOTH pending actions, or otherwise dismissed claims in those actions against the Other Named Defendants Covered by This Order, an ongoing remedial sanction shall be entered against him in the amount of \$250 per day, per Other Defendant Covered by This Order. Mr. Benshoof shall deposit such accrued amounts in the King County Superior Court Registry under this cause number and the Other Named Defendants may, at their option, apply for disbursement or seek to enter a judgment for any accrued amounts not so deposited.
- G. For any further legal proceedings filed by Mr. Benshoof in violation of the Abusive Litigation Order, he shall be assessed, in addition to any other sanction which may be imposed, a per diem sanction of \$250.00 per day per Person Covered by the Order named as a defendant in such action.

DATED this 1st day of March, 2024.

THE HONORABLE MARSHALL FERGUSON

King County Superior Court Judicial Electronic Signature Page

Case Number: 22-2-15958-8

Case Title: BENSHOOF VS CLIBER ET AL

Document Title: ORDER RE CONTEMPT SANCTIONS

Signed By: Marshall Ferguson
Date: March 01, 2024

MLIITIL

Judge: Marshall Ferguson

This document is signed in accordance with the provisions in GR 30.

Certificate Hash: A4ABB09C7C1D81F742E845B69E1C4CD6FEAA5E8C

Certificate effective date: 7/17/2023 2:21:34 PM Certificate expiry date: 7/17/2028 2:21:34 PM

Certificate Issued by: C=US, E=kcscefiling@kingcounty.gov, OU=KCDJA,

O=KCDJA, CN="Marshall Ferguson:

8skMktsk7hG1yuM6zbJ6iw=="